



Memphremagog Basin Water Quality Council

June 9th, 2023



Meeting Agenda

- 8:00 Welcome & review agenda
- 8:05 Roundtable introductions
- 8:10 Public Comment
- 8:15 Review and adoption of April 6, 2023 meeting minutes (Action)
- 8:20 CWSP Program Update
- 8:30 Review of Project Prioritization and Selection Process
- 8:40 Overview of Applications, DEC Comments, BWQC Discussion
- 9:10 Action on Projects
- 9:20 Project Pipeline Updates
- 9:30 Functioning Floodplain training highlights
- 9:35 Set deadlines for next application rounds
- 9:40 Next BWQC meetings – revised December date and agendas
- 9:45 Other non-regulatory water quality updates by partners/guests
- 10:00 Adjourn

Project Prioritization and Selection Process

From Rule § 39-403. Clean Water Projects.

- (a) With direction from the BWQC and in consultation with the applicable basin plan, the CWSP shall oversee identification and prioritization of clean water projects in accordance with the requirements of 10 V.S.A., Chapter 37, Subchapter 5, this Rule, and guidance.

- (b) (e) Clean Water Project Selection. Based upon project priorities identified under § 39-403(d), the BWQC shall consider the preliminary scoring and ranking of all proposed clean water projects as drafted by the CWSP for both project development or implementation categories and make any adjustments to the co-benefits scoring as needed. The BWQC shall vote to advance clean water projects for both development and construction to fulfill pollution reduction goals. Individual clean water projects should not be voted for advancement outside of this selection process unless to address an urgent water quality concern with the concurrence of the Secretary.

Proposed approach until Guidance finalized

- Act on ID/Assessment projects apart from Design/Implementation projects
- Consider whether projects require separate votes, as function of:
 - *Funding available for all projects in category?*
 - *Any projects not reasonable cost effectiveness?*
- *Need for any co-benefit score adjustment?*
- *Adopt motions/vote as necessary*

Context to consider in evaluating applications

- CWSPs and BWQCs must consider cost effectiveness when selecting projects for funding
- Key metric is cost per KG of Phosphorus reduced
- Average 'cost per KG reduction' is the basis for CWSP contracts with DEC (\$12,500 in Basin 17)
- Cost data we have now is not great (few COVID era projects; predated requirements like cultural review)
- DEC doesn't expect true thresholds until CWSPs and BWQCs have better data (gained from project rounds)

Project Scoring

Factor	Points	Description
P-reduction efficiency	60	Standardized DEC calculation: Ratio of proposed cost to overall p-reduction
Co-Benefits	20	Co-benefits scoring matrix
Project risk	8	Landowner relations, organizational capacity (4 points each)
Design Life, O&M	8	Sliding scale: For projects with > 15 years (4 points each)
Conformance with Basin Plan	4	Tactical Basin Plan priorities

P Reduction Scoring

Cost/kg	Cost/kg ratio Project/ basin target	Points awarded
\$1,563	0.125	60
\$3,125	0.25	50
\$6,250	0.5	40
\$12,500	1	30
\$25,000	2	20
\$50,000	4	10
\$100,000	8	0

Cost/kg	Ratio	Option 3 (.125-8)
\$1,250	0.1	63.2
\$2,500	0.2	53.2
\$5,000	0.4	43.2
\$10,000	0.8	33.2
\$12,500	1	30.0
\$15,000	1.2	27.4
\$20,000	1.6	23.2
\$30,000	2.4	17.4
\$40,000	3.2	13.2
\$50,000	4	10.0
\$60,000	4.8	7.4
\$70,000	5.6	5.1
\$80,000	6.4	3.2
\$90,000	7.2	1.5
\$100,000	8	0.0
\$110,000	8.8	-1.4
\$120,000	9.6	-2.6
\$130,000	10.4	-3.8

Scoring Scale

< \$1,563	60
< \$3,125	50
< \$6,250	40
< \$12,500	30
< \$25,000	20
< \$50,000	10
> \$100,000	0

Co-Benefits Scoring	
Environmental Justice Prioritizes vulnerable communities; Engages community stakeholders; Honors traditional ecological knowledge; Improves access to clean water and food; Protects sacred resources and indigenous land	(0-3 points)
Key Pollutants Other Than Phosphorus Nitrogen; road salts; microplastics/plastics; Sediments; Heavy metals; Pathogens Sewage/wastewater; Contaminants of emerging concern	(0-3 points)
Ecosystem Improvement/ Services and Climate Resiliency Flood resiliency and hazard mitigation; Reduced runoff and erosion; Carbon sequestration; Promotes biodiversity; including native pollinator species; Reduces spread of aquatic and/or terrestrial invasive species; Improves terrestrial and aquatic habitat and/or connectivity; Address high risk areas due to past environmental degradation	(0-3 points)
Recreation and Community Enhances accessibility to local natural areas; Provides or improves outdoor recreation opportunities; Protects green spaces and improves aesthetics; Enhances health and wellness; Increases tree canopy near recreational/community areas; Public/private partnership	(0-3 points)
Education Benefit Includes watershed education and awareness of environmental problems; Promotes trust among communities; scientists, and agencies; Project visibility and community outreach; Includes community volunteers	(0-3 points)
Enhances Local Economy Job creation, retention, and workforce development; Promotes sustainable energy practices; Increases property values	(0-3 points)
Other Co-Benefit Categories (different from any above)	(0-2 points)
Total Score Out of 20 points	

Project Requests/Available Funds

P Target KG	Project Funds Avail	ID/ Assessment (7%)	ID/ Assessment requested	Design/ Implementation allocation	Design/ Implementation requested	Round 1 P KG Reduction Totals
44.2	\$550,497	\$ 38,535	0	\$ 511,962	\$ 182,581	41.57

June Project Scoring

Applicant	Watershed Projects Database ID	Project Description	Project Stage	Annual P Reduction (kg/yr)	Total Project Costs	Cost Effectiveness (\$/kg/yr)	P Reduction Cost Score (Max. 60)	Other (Max. 20)	Co-benefits score (Max. 20)	Total >>>> Rank
MWA	11407	Continuation of a farm retirement and conservation acquisition with requested funds to be used to implement water quality projects related to the property's streams, wetlands, and floodplains, with some funds in the request used to bring the 90% designs to 100% designs, finalize and activate permits, and contract construction contractors.	Final Design & Implementation	28.57	\$ 231,534	\$ 8,104	30	16	12	58 >>>> 1
OCNRCD	11414	Project on Lake Willoughby seeks funds for a 30% design on three components: 1. Earthen Dam Removal, 2. Stream bypass gully removal, and 3. Restore old channel from the bypass gully to the below the dam back to a functional stream, riparian zone, and floodplain appropriate for its size	Preliminary Design	13	\$ 200,000	\$ 15,384	20	12	4	37 >>>> 2

Project Pipeline & Round 2

- Project Identification & Development Projects?
- Design, Engineering & Construction Projects?
- Outreach/Info Sessions

- Project Solicitation Round 2: June 26 – August 4
 - CWSP Review: August 7 – August 29
 - BWQC Review: August 30 – September 13
 - Project Prioritization: September 14, 2023

- December Meeting – Change from 12/14



BWQC Meeting Schedule

September 2023

- Project ranking & prioritization for Round 2 Project Solicitation
- Elect Chair & Vice-Chair

December 2023

- Project ranking & prioritization for Round 3 Project Solicitation
- Year in review: Lessons learned, revisit BWQC policies